Case studies for discussion:

What is the role of faculty in the following cases? How would you respond? How would you advise a junior colleague to respond? How should the institution respond? What is the balance between law/order and pedagogy? What is the student’s motivation?

1. Parental assistance

Pat is a senior in your anthropology seminar. You have had Pat in several classes. Pat is an outgoing, congenial student—but not a particularly strong writer. In previous classes, you have worked with Pat on structural issues—both at the paragraph level and at the whole-paper level. While you have seen some occasional improvements on revisions, you suspect that Pat is simply “doing what you say,” rather than really understanding how to organize the different ideas. As you read Pat’s seminar paper, you are stunned by the clarity and cleverness of the organization. While you would like to think that Pat has finally “gotten it,” you suspect that something else might be at work.

When you meet with Pat to talk about the paper, you ask about Pat’s writing process. Pat notes that the first draft was pretty rough. “In high school my mom helped me work on my papers, so I decided to ask her for help—since I really wanted to do a good job on this paper. The first draft was pretty rough, but the paper got better after my mom revised it. We went through several rounds of revision, and I’m pretty pleased with this version.”

- How do you respond to Pat’s revelation of parental revision?
- Does it make a difference that Pat offered this information without any prodding?
- How do you address the persistent pattern of parental assistance?
- Would it make a difference if Pat’s collaborator was a roommate instead of a parent?
2. Third-party reporting of cheating on a test

Two of the students in your biochemistry course come to see you during office hours on the afternoon after they have taken a test in the class. They claim that they both saw another student in the class cheating on the test by using a water bottle with notes written on the inside of the label. They are pretty upset. “It’s not fair; we studied really hard for this test. You are going to fail this student, aren’t you?”

• How do you respond to these students?

The accused student has been getting a C in the course. When you look at the test, it seems to be at about the same level as the student’s previous work. There is no obvious evidence of misconduct.

• How do you respond to the accused student?

3. Cut/paste from internet source

In your Shakespeare course, you give a paper assignment asking students to analyze character development in *Macbeth* by selecting a character and tracing his/her growth in the play. As you are grading Chris’ paper, you encounter several phrases that seem stylistically mismatched to the rest of the paper. These phrases are neither quoted nor cited in Chris’ paper. A Google search leads to several different online sites from which the phrases are taken. One of the phrases comes from a professional journal, properly quoted and cited on a separate online site (but not quoted or cited in Chris’ paper). Another phrase appears on a different online site without any quotation or attribution, but it sounds familiar; further investigation reveals that it comes from a different professional journal. A third phrase comes from a third site and seems to have originated on that site. A final phrase is a paraphrase drawn from a different journal article—again without citation.

• In talking with Chris, how (if at all) do you address the differences between these original sources?
• What are the messages that you want to communicate to Chris?
• How do you initiate the conversation with Chris?
• What sort of questions do you ask Chris?